



Still working for too little in Youngstown-Boardman

Michael Shields and Bryce Springfield

All work should pay enough to live a good life. All working people should be paid enough to provide for their families, no matter their race or gender, the kind of job they do, or where they live and work. For years, too many of greater Akron's most common jobs paid so little the typical worker would qualify for — and likely rely on — food aid to feed a family of three. By May 2022, the share of greater Youngstown's 10 most common jobs paying the median worker so little was five, slightly better than the six before COVID-19.

New statewide data show that 1) wages overall and in a majority of the state's most common occupations grew since 2019, and 2) some of the lowest-paying common jobs have been displaced in the top 10 by better-paying ones. However, these trends have not been shared evenly across the state. The Youngstown-Boardman Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA) has experienced wage growth in six of those jobs, compared with five for the state, but not enough to lift most workers in them out of economic precarity. These data are from Occupational Employment and Wage Statistics gathered over a three-year survey and using a model to estimate wages for 2022.

Jobs restored statewide, but not to Youngstown-Boardman

A full recovery must include all Ohio communities. With 210,100 people working as of May 2023, the Youngstown-Boardman metro area still faced a shortage of 5,100 jobs (-2.4%) as compared with February 2020, making it one of nine regions where jobs had yet to fully recover. These data are from the monthly Current Employment Statistics survey gathered by the Bureau of Labor Statistics and released with the unemployment rate.

Falling pay

From 2019 to 2022, wages fell overall by 2.3% for the typical (median) Youngstown MSA worker, accounting for all jobs. Among the Youngstown area's 10 most common jobs, wages rose in six. The number of jobs in the 10 biggest occupations that still paid so little that the middle worker would qualify for, and likely need, food aid to feed a family of three fell to five in 2022, compared with six in 2019. Wages below 130% of the poverty level, \$29,939 in 2022, meet that threshold. Just three occupations paid enough for financial security: a wage at least 200% of the poverty level (\$46,060).

Still working for too little

Pay growth recovered lost ground in most common Youngstown-Boardman MSA jobs

Top 10 occupations 2022	Job growth			Pay growth			Pay level	
	2022 rank	2022 jobs	Change in jobs since 2019	2022 median hourly pay	Pay change since 2019	Percent pay change since 2019	2022 median annual pay	2022 pay as a share of poverty
Fast Food and Counter Workers	1	7,020	-1880	\$10.79	\$0.73	7.3%	\$22,450	97%
Cashiers	2	6,150	180	\$11.00	-\$0.47	-4.1%	\$22,880	99%
Retail Salespersons	3	5,620	-2080	\$12.74	\$0.93	7.8%	\$26,500	115%
General and Operations Managers	4	4,810	2090	\$35.86	-\$10.71	-23.0%	\$74,590	324%
Stockers and Order Fillers	5	4,790	1530	\$14.31	\$1.68	13.3%	\$29,760	129%
Home Health and Personal Care Aides	6	4,640	-840	\$12.57	\$0.41	3.4%	\$26,140	114%
Registered Nurses	7	4,110	80	\$33.00	\$1.81	5.8%	\$68,640	298%
Office Clerks, General	8	4,100	-1020	\$17.29	-\$0.46	-2.6%	\$35,970	156%
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	9	3,860	-10	\$22.36	-\$1.79	-7.4%	\$46,510	202%
Laborers and Freight, Stock, and Material Movers, Hand	10	3,810	-440	\$16.01	\$1.06	7.1%	\$33,300	145%

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS), Occupational Employment and Wage Statistics (OEWS) Survey, May 2019, and May 2022. Estimates, available at <https://www.bls.gov/oes/tables.htm>, updated April 24, 2023. Largest detail occupations in Ohio by employment. Median annual pay shown as a share of the poverty threshold for a family of three in 2022 (\$23,030). The gross monthly income threshold for food assistance is 130% of poverty (\$29,939) or less. Note that BLS implemented a change to the data classification methodology between 2019 and 2022. See Bureau of Labor Statistics, Survey Methods and Reliability Statement for MB3 Research Estimates of the Occupational Employment and Wage Statistics Survey. We have used the updated MB3 method. Wages in red are less than 130% of the poverty level for a family of three. Figures in orange represent a decrease in either jobs or pay.

Wages at all jobs should cover the basics, so people and their families can thrive. While fewer working Youngstown/Boardman residents are struggling on the brink of poverty, many jobs still pay too little for financial security. Policymakers must step up to ensure that every Youngstown area and Ohio job is a good job that enables the worker to thrive.